



INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS

Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi Disciplinary
Peer Reviewed Edition :

www.ijlra.com

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume 2 Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

IJLRA

EDITORIAL TEAM

EDITORS



Megha Middha

Megha Middha, Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar

Megha Middha, is working as an Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar (Rajasthan). She has an experience in the teaching of almost 3 years. She has completed her graduation in BBA LL.B (H) from Amity University, Rajasthan (Gold Medalist) and did her post-graduation (LL.M in Business Laws) from NLSIU, Bengaluru. Currently, she is enrolled in a Ph.D. course in the Department of Law at Mohanlal Sukhadia University, Udaipur (Rajasthan). She wishes to excel in academics and research and contribute as much as she can to society. Through her interactions with the students, she tries to inculcate a sense of deep thinking power in her students and enlighten and guide them to the fact how they can bring a change to the society

Dr. Samrat Datta

Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board



Dr. Namita Jain



Head & Associate Professor

School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.

Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi.(2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019

Mrs.S.Kalpana

Assistant professor of Law

Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr. Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8 Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1 Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.



Avinash Kumar



Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC - NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR - Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and learning.

ABOUT US

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS
ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

“COMPARATIVE STUDY OF EMERGENCY PROVISIONS IN INDIA, GERMANY, U.K., CANADA AND U.S.A.”

AUTHORED BY - PRAGATI PANKAJ DEHLIWAL

Affiliation- LLM I student at P.E.S. Modern Law College, Pune

Abstract

The present article discusses the provisions of emergencies across various countries including India, Germany, Canada, the U.K. and the U.S.A. The approach of each nation to manage emergencies is shaped by its unique legal frameworks, constitutional principles, and historical contexts. In India the Constitution allows for the suspension of certain fundamental rights during emergencies, with parliamentary and judicial oversight. Similarly, Germany balances emergency measures with constitutional protections, ensuring the preservation of individual rights. The UK relies on the Civil Contingencies Act to manage emergencies while upholding fundamental rights. Canada's decentralized approach delegates emergency management primarily to provincial and territorial governments. All over, a delicate balance is struck between protecting public safety and preserving civil liberties, guided by principles of legality, necessity, and proportionality. Robust mechanisms for oversight and accountability are essential to uphold democratic values and the rule of law during crises. By maintaining this balance, nations can effectively navigate emergencies while safeguarding the fundamental rights and values of their citizens.

Keywords- *Emergency, Fundamental rights, Balance, laws*

Introduction

Emergency is the kind of a situation where the Government of a country changes the normal functioning of a nation by either altering or suspending certain and other organs of the Government rights as per the Constitution.

There can be different types of conditions that can be referred to as the reasons for the

Government of a nation to pronounce a state of emergency, for example, civil unrest, natural calamity or disaster, armed rebellion or conflict, war, etc. After proclamation of emergency in a nation, the typical texture of its Constitution, and other bodies such as the political, financial, and social climate of that nation is changed and the rights of the citizens are either curtailed or suspended. The power of emergency thus sometimes described as a curse to tackle sudden, unsuspecting threats, while on the other hand, it can become a tool in the hands of a Government to carry out its agendas and suppress its dissidents.¹

In this article, various emergency laws and conditions of India, Germany, Canada, the U.K and the U.S.A. are discussed and how each one of these countries differ and are similar in the implementation of their emergency laws are mentioned.

I. Provisions of Emergency in India

In India, emergency provisions are outlined in **Part XVIII (Articles 352 to 360)** of the Constitution of India. These provisions empower the President to declare three types of emergencies: National Emergency, State Emergency (President's Rule) and Financial Emergency.

1. National Emergency:

Article 352: The President can declare a National Emergency if there is a threat to the security of India due to war, external aggression, or armed rebellion.² The term 'armed rebellion' was inserted by the 44th amendment. Earlier, it was internal disturbance.

- **Effects on Rights:** During a National Emergency, the President can suspend the enforcement of fundamental rights guaranteed by Articles 19 and 21 that is the right of freedom of speech and expression, the right to assemble peacefully, and the right to move freely throughout the country and personal liberty.
- **Duration and Approval:** A National Emergency must be approved by both Houses of Parliament within the period of one month. It initially lasts for six months and can be extended to indefinite period with parliamentary approval.

2. State Emergency i.e. President's Rule:

¹ www.aequivic.in

² www.sdeuoc.ac.in

- **Article 356:** The President of India can impose President's Rule in a state if there is a failure of constitutional machinery in that state. This typically occurs when the state government is unable to function according to the provisions of the Constitution.³
- **Effects on Rights:** During President's Rule, the state government is dismissed, and the Governor assumes the powers of the state legislature. While fundamental rights remain enforceable, the President can make any necessary modifications or exceptions to ensure the governance of the state.
- **Duration and Approval:** President's Rule initially lasts for six months and can be extended for up to three years with parliamentary approval. However, it must be ratified by both Houses of Parliament within two months of its declaration.

3. Financial Emergency:

- **Article 360:** The President can declare a Financial Emergency if there is a threat to the financial stability or credits of India or any part of its territory.
- **Effects on Rights:** Unlike National and State Emergencies, a Financial Emergency does not have direct impact on fundamental rights. Instead, it allows the President to issue directions to states regarding financial matters and to regulate the financial system of the country.
- **Duration and Approval:** A Financial Emergency must be approved by both Houses of Parliament within the period of two months.⁴ It remains in force until revoked by the President.

4. Judicial Review:

- All emergency proclamations and actions taken during emergencies are subject to judicial review. The Supreme Court of India has the authority to review the validity of emergency proclamations and the legality of actions taken by the government during emergencies.

In summary, emergency provisions in India grant the government significant powers to address threats to national security, constitutional breakdowns in states, and financial instability. While these provisions are meant to be temporary measures to be used in exceptional circumstances, their implementation can have significant implications for the rights and freedoms of individuals. Judicial oversight and public scrutiny are crucial in ensuring that emergency powers are exercised judiciously and in accordance with the principles of Constitution.

³ *Ibid*

⁴ www.assamexam.com

II. Provisions of Emergency in Germany

Germany has provisions for emergencies outlined in its Basic Law (Grundgesetz) and other related legislation. The Basic Law guarantees fundamental rights to all individuals in Germany, including during times of emergency.

1. **Legal Framework:**

- **Basic Law (Grundgesetz):** The Basic Law is Germany's constitution and serves as the foundation for the country's legal system. It includes provisions related to emergencies and the protection of fundamental rights.
- **Emergency Legislation:** The German Emergency Acts known as "Notstandsgezetse" introduced various changes to the German Constitution and led to the incorporation of certain emergency provisions in the Constitution. It gave the federal government a tool to act in a situation of crisis such as a natural disaster, war, or any kind of rebellion. The Constitution of Germany has very comprehensive and detailed provisions concerning emergency that permit the proper functioning of the basic democratic rules and regulations even during the period of an emergency.⁵

2. **Types of Emergencies:**

- A "**State of defence**" exists when the republic is under attack or threat of imminent attack by an armed force.
- A "**State of tension**" covers the conditions that precede a state of defence, such as a "situation approaching civil war or preparation for international war".
- "**Internal state of emergency**" covers natural disasters, grave accidents, threats to the free democratic order in the federation, or dangers to public security or order.⁶

3. **Declaration of Emergency:**

- **Responsibility:** The declaration of an emergency in Germany can be made by various authorities, including the Federal Government, State Governments (Länder), and local authorities, depending on the nature and scope of the emergency.
- **Emergency Powers:** Once an emergency is declared, the government may activate emergency powers and measures to address the situation effectively. These powers may include the

⁵ *Supra* 3.

⁶ www.docplayer.net

deployment of emergency services, restrictions on movement, and allocation of resources to affected areas.

4. **Effect on Rights and Liberties:**

The Basic Law guarantees fundamental rights to all individuals in Germany, including the right to human dignity, freedom of expression, freedom of assembly, and the right to privacy. While fundamental rights are protected under the Basic Law, certain rights are restricted such as Restriction of the fundamental rights of the secrecy of letters, post and telecommunications, fundamental right to freedom of movement, etc. However, any limitations must be proportionate and subject to judicial review.

5. **Emergency Measures:**

- **Public Safety Measures:** During emergencies, the government may implement measures to ensure public safety and mitigate risks to the population. These measures could include evacuation orders, curfews, and restrictions on gatherings. It requires compulsory service for defense purposes.

Emergency measures must strike a balance between protecting public safety and respecting individual rights and freedoms. The government is expected to use emergency powers judiciously and ensure that any restrictions on rights are justified and proportionate.

6. **Oversight and Accountability:**

- **Parliamentary Oversight:** The German Bundestag (federal parliament) plays a crucial role in overseeing emergency measures and ensuring that they comply with the Basic Law. Parliamentarians have the authority to review emergency regulations and hold the government accountable for its response to emergencies.
- **Legal Review:** Individuals affected by emergency measures may seek legal recourse through the courts to challenge the legality or constitutionality of government actions. German courts have the authority to review emergency regulations and determine whether they comply with legal standards and fundamental rights.

In summary, Germany has provisions for managing emergencies outlined in its Basic Law and other related legislation. While emergency measures may temporarily restrict certain rights and freedoms, they must be proportionate, necessary, and subject to oversight to ensure they comply with legal standards and protect fundamental rights.

III. Provisions of Emergency in the U.K.

In the United Kingdom, the provisions for declaring emergencies and their effects on rights are governed by various laws and regulations.

Legal Framework:

- **Civil Contingencies Act 2004 (CCA):** The CCA is the primary legislation governing emergency preparedness and response in the UK. It replaced previous emergency laws and established a comprehensive framework for managing emergencies.
- **Devolved Administrations:** Emergency powers and procedures also exist within the devolved administrations of Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland. Each devolved government has its own legislation and frameworks for managing emergencies within its jurisdiction.

2. **Types of Emergencies:**

- **Defined Categories:** The CCA categorizes emergencies into two types: "Emergency" and "Major Emergency." An emergency is defined as an event or situation that threatens serious damage to human welfare, the environment, or security.⁷ A major emergency is an emergency that requires a significant multi-agency response.
- **National Security Emergencies:** In cases of threats to national security, the government may invoke additional powers and measures under national security legislation, such as the Terrorism Act 2000 and the Security Service Act 1989.

3. **Declaration of Emergency:**

The decision to declare an emergency rests with the relevant authorities, such as central government ministers, local authorities, or emergency responders, depending on the nature and scale of the emergency.

Once an emergency is declared, the government may activate emergency powers and measures to respond to the situation effectively. These powers may include the ability to issue emergency regulations, requisition resources, and coordinate response efforts across agencies and jurisdictions.

4. **Effect on Rights and Liberties:**

The Human Rights Act incorporates the rights and freedoms enshrined in the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) into UK law. These rights include the right to life, freedom

⁷ www.whatdotheyknow.com

from torture and inhuman treatment, freedom of expression, and the right to a fair trial.

While the Human Rights Act protects individual rights, it also recognizes that certain rights may be limited in exceptional circumstances, such as during emergencies. However, any limitations must be proportionate, necessary, and subject to legal scrutiny.

5. **Emergency Measures and Restrictions:**

During emergencies, the government may implement measures to protect public safety and mitigate risks. These measures could include evacuation orders, travel restrictions, curfews, and temporary closure of public spaces.

Emergency measures must strike a balance between protecting public safety and respecting individual rights and freedoms. The government is expected to use emergency powers judiciously and transparently, ensuring that any restrictions on rights are justified and proportionate.

6. **Oversight and Accountability:**

The UK Parliament plays a crucial role in scrutinizing emergency powers and measures. Parliamentarians have the authority to review emergency regulations, question government ministers, and hold the government to account for its response to emergencies.

- **Legal Review:** Individuals affected by emergency measures may seek legal recourse through the courts to challenge the legality or constitutionality of government actions. Courts have the authority to review emergency regulations and determine whether they comply with legal standards and human rights obligations.

In summary, emergency management in the UK is governed by the Civil Contingencies Act 2004 and other relevant legislation. While emergency measures may temporarily restrict certain rights and freedoms, they must be justified, proportionate, and subject to oversight to ensure they comply with legal standards and human rights obligations.

IV. **Provisions of Emergency in Canada**

Canada, unlike some other countries such as the United States and India, does not have a formalized concept of a "State of Emergency" at the federal level.⁸ Instead, it relies on various laws and regulations to address emergencies and their impacts on rights.

1. **Emergency Management Framework:**

⁸ "Constitutional Resilience and the COVID-19 Pandemic", Springer science and Business Media LLC, 2022

- **Federal and Provincial Jurisdictions:** Emergency management in Canada is primarily the responsibility of provincial and territorial governments. Each province and territory has its own legislation and frameworks for managing emergencies within its jurisdiction.
- **Federal Role:** While the provinces and territories are primarily responsible for emergency management, the federal government can provide assistance and support when requested by the affected province or territory. The federal government also has specific responsibilities for emergencies that fall under its jurisdiction, such as national security threats and emergencies that cross provincial or international borders.

2. **Provincial and Territorial Emergency Powers:**

Each province and territory has legislation that outlines emergency powers and procedures. These laws typically grant authorities to the government or designated officials to declare emergencies, implement emergency measures, and coordinate response efforts.

Provincial and territorial governments have the authority to declare a state of emergency when faced with significant threats or disasters. This declaration may trigger various emergency measures, such as evacuations, restrictions on movement, and allocation of resources.

3. **Effect on Rights and Liberties:**

The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms guarantees fundamental rights and freedoms to all Canadians. These rights include freedom of expression, assembly, and association, as well as legal protections against arbitrary detention and discrimination. While the Charter protects individual rights, it also recognizes that some rights may be limited in certain circumstances, including during emergencies. However, any limitations on rights must be justified as reasonable and justified in a free and democratic society, as per Section 1 of the Charter.

4. **Emergency Measures and Restrictions:**

During emergencies, governments may implement measures to protect public safety and mitigate risks. These measures could include mandatory evacuations, curfews, restrictions on gatherings, and closure of non-essential businesses.

Emergency measures must balance the need to protect public safety with respect for individual rights and freedoms. Governments are expected to use emergency powers judiciously and proportionately, ensuring that any restrictions on rights are necessary and justified given the circumstances.

5. **Oversight and Accountability:**

- **Legislative Scrutiny:** Provincial and territorial emergency management legislation typically includes provisions for oversight and accountability. This may involve regular reporting to the legislature, review by parliamentary committees, and mechanisms for public accountability.
- **Judicial Review:** Individuals affected by emergency measures may seek recourse through the courts to challenge the legality or constitutionality of government actions. Courts have the authority to review emergency measures and determine whether they comply with constitutional requirements and legal standards.

6. **International and Interprovincial Cooperation:**

In cases of emergencies that cross provincial or international borders, governments may coordinate response efforts and share resources through mutual aid agreements and international partnerships.

Canada also has obligations under international law to cooperate with other countries and international organizations in responding to emergencies, including humanitarian crises and natural disasters.

In summary, emergency management in Canada is decentralized, with provinces and territories primarily responsible for managing emergencies within their jurisdictions. While emergency measures may temporarily limit certain rights and freedoms, they must be justified, proportionate, and subject to oversight to ensure they comply with constitutional and legal standards.

V. **Provisions of Emergency in the U.S.A.**

In the United States, the provisions for declaring a national emergency and its effects on rights are governed by a combination of constitutional principles, statutory laws, and legal precedents.

Declaration of National Emergency:

- **Authority:** The President of the United States is granted authority to declare a national emergency under the National Emergencies Act of 1976 (NEA). This act delegates certain powers to the President in response to various threats, including national security concerns, public health emergencies, natural disasters, and other crises. The NEA does not explicitly define what constitutes a national emergency, leaving the determination largely to the discretion of the President. However, the President must cite specific statutory authorities under which the emergency is declared, and the declaration must be published in the Federal Register.

- **Duration:** Once declared, a national emergency can remain in effect indefinitely. However, it is subject to annual review by the President, who must formally renew the emergency declaration if it is to continue.

2. Powers Granted to the President:

- **Expanded Executive Authority:** A national emergency declaration grants the President access to a range of powers and authorities, including the ability to reallocate funds, deploy military forces domestically, regulate commerce, and issue executive orders to address the emergency.
- **Specific Statutory Authorities:** The President may invoke specific laws to respond to the emergency, such as the Robert T. Stafford Disaster Relief and Emergency Assistance Act for natural disasters or the International Emergency Economic Powers Act for national security threats.

3. Effects on Rights and Civil Liberties:

- **Suspension of Certain Legal Protections:** While the US Constitution does not explicitly provide for the suspension of rights during emergencies, emergency declarations may lead to actions that impact civil liberties. For example, the government may impose restrictions on travel, assembly, and commerce in the interest of public safety.
- **Increased Surveillance and Security Measures:** During emergencies, there may be heightened government surveillance and security measures aimed at identifying and mitigating threats. This could include increased monitoring of communications, expanded law enforcement powers, and deployment of security personnel.
- **Challenges to Individual Rights:** Emergency measures may sometimes infringe upon individual rights, leading to legal challenges and debates over the balance between security and civil liberties. Courts play a crucial role in reviewing the constitutionality of emergency actions and ensuring that fundamental rights are protected.

4. Judicial Review and Congressional Oversight:

- **Judicial Scrutiny:** Emergency actions are subject to judicial review, with the courts serving as a check on executive power. Courts may review the legality and constitutionality of emergency measures, including their impact on individual rights.
- **Congressional Oversight:** While the President has authority to declare a national emergency, Congress retains oversight powers. Congress can terminate a national emergency declaration

through a joint resolution passed by both chambers, although such terminations are subject to presidential veto and require a two-thirds majority to override.

5. **Historical Context and Precedents:**

- The United States has declared numerous national emergencies throughout its history, addressing a wide range of threats and crises. Each declaration has varied in scope and impact, shaping legal precedents and debates over executive authority and individual rights.

In summary, while national emergency declarations in the United States grant the President expanded powers to respond to crises, they also raise important questions about the balance between security and civil liberties. Judicial review, congressional oversight, and public scrutiny play essential roles in ensuring that emergency measures are consistent with constitutional principles and protect fundamental rights.

Conclusion

Emergencies may necessitate the temporary suspension or restriction of certain rights and freedoms to safeguard public safety and national security, it is imperative that such measures are proportionate, necessary, and subject to rigorous oversight and accountability mechanisms.⁹

The provisions for emergencies vary across different countries, reflecting unique constitutional frameworks, legal traditions, and historical contexts. Like the USA, India, the UK, Canada, and Germany each have distinct legal frameworks governing emergencies. In the USA, emergency declarations grant the President expanded powers, subject to checks and balances from the legislative and judicial branches. In India, emergency provisions in the Constitution allow for the suspension of certain fundamental rights, with parliamentary and judicial oversight. The UK relies on the Civil Contingencies Act to manage emergencies while upholding fundamental rights and liberties. Canada's decentralized approach delegates emergency management primarily to provincial and territorial governments, with a commitment to protecting individual rights. Germany similarly balances emergency measures with constitutional protections, ensuring that fundamental rights are upheld even during crises.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. M.P. JAIN "Indian Constitutional Law" 8th Edition
2. D.D. BASU "Comparative Constitutional Law", 3rd Edition
3. S.R. MYNENI'S "Comparative Constitutional Law"

⁹ *Supra* 10.

4. U.S. Constitution, Art. I & 9, cl. 2, Article 10, para. 3., U.S. Constitution Amend. V, cl 1.
5. “Basic Law for the Federal Republic of Germany” https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/englisch_gg/
6. EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW (VENICE COMMISSION) [https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/default.aspx?pdffile=CDL-STD\(1995\)012-e](https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/default.aspx?pdffile=CDL-STD(1995)012-e)

